



Muskegon Community College

BOARD OF TRUSTEES BOARD MEETING MINUTES May 15, 2013 – 12:30 p.m. Room 1100 Stevenson Center Lecture Hall

Present: Chair Crandall, Vice-Chair Osborn, Trustee Frye, Trustee Lester, Trustee Mullally, Trustee Oakes and Trustee Portenga

Chair Crandall called the meeting to order at 12:30 PM

1. Agenda

Trustee Lester moved to accept the agenda; second. Vote unanimous; motion carried.

2. Minutes

- Board Open Finance Committee Minutes – April 15, 2013

Trustee Osborn moved to accept the minutes; second. Vote unanimous; motion carried.

- Board Study Session Minutes – April 15, 2013

Trustee Mullally moved to accept the minutes; second. Vote unanimous; motion carried.

- Board Closed Session Minutes – April 15, 2013

Trustee Lester moved to accept the minutes; second. Vote unanimous; motion carried.

- Board Meeting Minutes – April 17, 2013

Vice Chair Osborn moved to accept the minutes; second. Vote unanimous; motion carried.

3. Public Comments

- Presentation of Awards for Phi Theta Kappa All-USA Community College Academic Team Nominees – *Dr. Nesbary*

Dr. Nesbary presented the awards to recipients Mikaela Taylor and Tiffany Kolakowski.

- 25th Annual Reeths-Puffer and Twin Lake Elementary “A Day for Me at MCC” Presentations

Dr. Nesbary welcomed students and teachers from Reeths-Puffer and Twin Lake Elementary schools. The first and second place student winners read their essays.

- Public comments – President’s Evaluation

Toby Moleski, President of the Faculty Association commented regarding the process for the presidents’ /administrators’ 360-evaluation, stating the public forum won’t give much useful information as it’s hard to speak publically and in a public forum about a superior. Toby indicated he would expect for the presidents’ evaluation to see the president’s of the three organized units, the VP’s and assistant VP’s. He would expect for the VP of Academic Affairs and Finance to see all the chairs of the academic departments, and for the VP of Student Services and Administration, the chair of counseling. Evaluations are to get someone who is good to be great, and you can’t know how to improve if you don’t know what you’re doing wrong. Getting input from subordinates is critical. Toby shared a couple of ideas of how the 360 could be done. Email is good, but we have resources on campus that could be used: 1) Blackboard - create a “fake classroom” for use by individuals whose input is desired for the evaluation; there are several tools including anonymous posts; 2) Class Climate, which is currently used to evaluate instructors and department chairs. Data is automatically generated. Exact criteria for evaluation may be placed in a question format with comments at the end, and this data is great to learn what can be done to improve.

Toby was thanked for his comments. The Board agrees they need to revise the process. They are currently redesigning the process and will discuss this in the agenda later today; it’s an evolutionary process.

4. Consent Agenda (*Board Action Required - Vote*)

A. Budget/Finance

1. Finance Committee Report – *Trustee Lester*
2. Treasurer and Financial Reports – *Trustee Lester*

Following discussion at the Finance Committee meeting on Monday, the Board questioned what was decided on the pre-paid for Trustee Portenga/any pre-paid and whether the Board is going to change how this has been done in the past, or initiate that it will be acceptable to pre-pay?

Trustee Oakes made a motion that the Board may pre-pay and have it deducted in the proper fiscal year; second. Vote unanimous; motion carried.

B. Personnel

1. Personnel Committee Report – *Trustee Mullally*
2. Personnel Report – *Aaron Hilliard*

Trustee Portenga moved the consent agenda be adopted; second. Trustee Oakes requested the financials be removed for discussion. With this request, the financial report was removed from the consent agenda. The vote was unanimous to approve the remainder of the consent agenda; motion carried.

5. Administrative Reports

- A. Academic Affairs – *Teresa Sturrus*
- B. Student Success Report – *Dr. John Selmon*
 - a. Enrollment

b. Student Success Completion Agenda

There were no additional reports.

6. Business Non Operational

A. MCCA Report – *Trustee Lester*

Trustee Lester reported, per information received yesterday, it's possible the committee may bring forward in-district tuition for veterans this week.

B. Foundation Update – *Vice-Chair Osborn*

A reminder of the June 14th golf outing was given and an invitation to join the group for lunch.

7. Old Business

8. New Business

A. Summary of Auditor's Meeting with the Finance Committee – *Trustee Lester*

At the meeting Monday, the report from consultant Deanna Coleman of Covington Services was discussed with the auditors, who indicated MCC is reporting as required. The financials and budgeting will now include depreciation, instead of holding it for year end and some adjustments in the balance sheet were made so the Board sees activities in funds on a monthly basis; some accruals have been added on a monthly basis, but for the most part adjustments will be done at year end.

B. Ratification of the ESSU 2012 – 2015 Collective Bargaining Agreement – *Aaron Hilliard*

- Following the bargaining sessions with the ESSU, Vice Presidents and consultants, a tentative agreement has been reached. This agreement has been ratified by the ESSU and is presented to the Board for approval. A summary document was sent to the Board on Monday for review.
- 28.4 was mentioned twice in the summary document, with different language each time. Aaron Hilliard clarified the proposed changes.

Trustee Osborn made a motion to approve the recommendation that the Board of Trustees ratify the 2012-2015 collective bargaining agreement between the Muskegon Community College Board of Trustees and the Muskegon Community College Educational Support Staff Unit; second. Vote unanimous; motion carried.

C. Budget – *Dr. Nesbary, VP Teresa Sturrus & Beth Dick*

- The Budget document for FY2013-2014 has been reviewed in detail by the Board. In the appendix there is an updated list of Budget Assumptions, with budget balancing strategies added.
- Gerry Nyland anticipates natural gas will go up based on what was paid this year and made his best conservative guess of an 8%-10% increase.
- #24 eliminating career focus would save \$25k
- The Board questioned the 1% increase for APS, what that dollar amount would be with fringe benefits, etc. Beth will get this information and forward it to the Board.

- The 4.7% increase for tuition, and \$7 increase to fees, will cover 35% of revenues. A concern was raised that these increases are on the backs of student's. At some point we will have to consider holding wages, because we're still adding this additional amount on the backs of students; leaving less Pell grant monies for incidentals. This consideration hasn't been factored in, and we are in challenging times with revenues. Another Board member commented that in addition to the increases to students, we have also eliminated a lot of positions. There is going to be a point where some hard decisions need to be made about how deeply we can cut into positions, and how high we can raise tuition, if we're not finding other revenue. The solution is to control our wages and fringes, and this will need to be addressed seriously in the next round of talks. Much was done in this round, changing the whole make-up of the contracts, the steps, etc., and the next step may be to look at deep cuts.
- A request was made to look at holding wages this year with APS and the president. Also related to the 5% increase for adjuncts, whether we start at 5% or something a little lower? With no increases since 2006, it is recommended the Board move ahead with approval of the 5% adjunct increase. The line has been held with APS staff for the last several years, with very little salary increase. The whole big picture needs to be reviewed and then budget accordingly, looking at reasonable amounts.
- The Board requested Human Resources and Finance get a good, true picture of the cost of benefits and fringes for next month's Finance Committee meeting, because 51% is extremely high, and the Board needs to review this. This will be added to the June Finance Committee meeting agenda.

Trustee Frye moved to approve the assumptions; second. Vote unanimous; motion carried.

D. President Nesbary's Annual Evaluation – *Chair Crandall*

The Board evaluation tool was printed and distributed to the Board. Chair Crandall indicated this is an evolutionary process and the Board has decided to revise the process from what was communicated at the Study Session on Monday. The Board will explore Toby's suggestions of using mechanisms available on campus for some of the 360's. The Board will select five internal and two external individuals, one from each of the units including the student body, and they will be asked very specific questions related to the objectives established for the president. The feedback obtained will be distributed to each Board member who will have the opportunity to take that feedback into consideration as they do their individual evaluations.

E. Board Evaluation – (*Board Action Required*) - *Trustee Mullally*

F. Approval of Early Retirement Incentive – *Aaron Hilliard*

Trustee Mullally moved approval; second.

The Board asked if legal had reviewed the incentive; Aaron Hilliard responded it was not reviewed by legal, but a detailed process was followed for developing the incentive.

The Board asked if there is a length of time an employee must be employed before they are offered the incentive. Aaron responded, we are asking that a person be eligible to receive their retirement plan, and administration has the ability to deny the incentive.

Vote unanimous; motion carried.

9. Board of Trustees Policy Manual Updates – *Chair Crandall*
10. Announcements
 - ✓ **All Board meetings have been moved to the Stevenson Center, with the exception of July. Please check your calendar in the Board Portal.**
 - A. President’s Report – *President Nesbary*
<https://mymcc.muskegoncc.edu/board/Documents/President's%20Report%20May%202013.pdf>
 - B. President’s Message, May 2013 – *President Nesbary*
 - C. Departmental Updates – *President Nesbary*
 - D. Board Comments

With no further business, Trustee Oakes moved to adjourn the meeting; second. The meeting was adjourned at 2:00 p.m.

Minutes submitted by Secretary, Nancy Frye.

/csd