



**BOARD OF TRUSTEES
BOARD MEETING MINUTES
May 16, 2012 – 12:30 p.m.
1100 Stevenson Center**

Present: Chair Crandall, Vice-Chair Oakes, Trustee Lester, Trustee Mullally, Trustee Osborn and Trustee Portenga

Absent: Trustee Frye

Chair Crandall called the meeting to order at 12:27 p.m.

1. Agenda

Trustee Portenga moved to adopt the agenda; second. Vote unanimous; motion carried.

2. Minutes

- Board Study Session Minutes – April 16, 2012

Trustee Portenga moved approval; second. Vote unanimous; motion carried.

- Board Meeting Minutes – April 18, 2012

Trustee Lester moved approval; second. Vote unanimous; motion carried.

- Closed Session Minutes – April 16, 2012

Vice-Chair Oakes moved approval; second. Vote unanimous; motion carried.

3. Public Comments

- Phi Theta Kappa All-USA Community College Academic Team Nominees – Dale Nesbary

President Nesbary congratulated and presented certificates to nominees Tammie Anderson and Hope Buell.

- Reeths-Puffer and Twin Lake Elementary Third Grade 24th Annual
“A Day for Me at MCC” Presentations

President Nesbary welcomed the group and a PowerPoint slide show of their day on campus was viewed. Kevin Richards and Doug Clarke thanked MCC for the day and introduced the student winners. The student poster contest winners discussed their design and essay winners read their essays and were congratulated.

4. Consent Agenda (*Board Action Required - Vote*)

A. Budget/Finance

1. Finance Committee Report – *Trustee Lester*

2. Treasurer and Financial Reports – *Trustee Lester*

B. Personnel

1. Personnel Committee Report – *Trustee Osborn*
2. Personnel Report – *Aaron Hilliard*

Vice-Chair Oakes moved approval of the consent agenda; second. Vote unanimous; motion carried.

5. Administrative Reports

- A. Academic Affairs – *Teresa Sturuss*
- B. Student Success Report – *Dr. John Selmon*
 - a. Enrollment
 - b. Student Success Completion Agenda

6. Business Non Operational

A. President's Evaluation

President Nesbary's Annual Evaluation was completed at Monday's Board Study Session and the summary document with individual and combined scores and comments was distributed as part of today's Board packet.

Trustee Portenga moved approval of President Nesbary's Annual Evaluation; second.

Comments:

- Liked the metrics, but feel they are sometimes too specific (ex: one metric where the president was to attend 50% of an organizations' meetings, he attended 7 out of 14 and so he "met" the metric) ... but that score didn't reflect the spirit of the meeting; the spirit of the metric was whether the President was involved in the community...which he exceeded. Maybe some of the metrics should be a little more general.
- It was noted that the Board insisted on measurable outcomes, which will be kept in mind when establishing metrics for next year's evaluation. The President's contract is up for renewal July 1st and will be added to the June Board agenda.

Vote unanimous; motion carried.

B. MCCA Report – *Trustee Lester*

Nothing additional to report.

C. Business Department Micro Loan Program – *Dan Bialas & David Stradal*

The Finance Committee will look into the details of this proposal and bring a recommendation back to the full Board in June. Any additional background information Administration is able to supply would be helpful.

7. Old Business

A. Food and Catering Services Bid Award – *Rosemary Zink*

Trustee Oakes moved approval of Creative Dining Services from 7/1/12 through 6/30/17; second. Vote unanimous; motion carried.

B. Vending Machine Services Bid Award – *Rosemary Zink*

Trustee Portenga moved approval of Compass Group Canteen from 7/1/12 to 6/30/17; second.

Several issues were raised by the Board as follows:

- Due to some recent information received, there is concern with awarding the bid to Canteen. While nothing is wrong with the process, our current vendor was directed to increase some prices after the fact. The requested price increase was due to an agreement between the bookstore, vending and foodservice to keep prices equivalent.
- There were problems with Canteen's service to MCC 14 years ago with receiving commission and MCC had to go back over a period of time to collect, which is why another vendor was chosen. Also concerning is everything was good at first, but because MCC was a very small client, after a while the service changed.
- MCC's bidding process includes the ability to accept or reject all bids. In the past the college did not dictate prices, keeping prices down for students. Could we rebid or renegotiate with our current vendor? We have had this vendor for 14 years; they are doing good work in the community with good local partnerships and providing jobs for people who may not have otherwise had them. Concerned about loss of jobs in the community by switching vendors. A representative from Pioneer Resources attended today's meeting, making himself available to answer questions.
- Why are we doing this? Why do we have vending machines on campus – is it to make maximum profit? If so maybe we go with Canteen. Maybe that isn't our only priority? Charge more affordable prices as a tradeoff for slimmer profit margin? Sounds like that is the spirit Pioneer's bid was drafted. How does raising prices have any effect on Pioneer vs. Canteen?
- Trustee Oakes did not get a chance to review the additional information and would like a chance to do so.
- Although caught off guard by a bidder coming in after the fact saying we didn't get it, we're local, give it to us, MCC will have this with every bid, causing issues, if we allow it this time. If we bid with that type of process, we'll be adding onto tuition rates to cover the cost – with any local group, not just Pioneer. On the other hand, with the new information and the fact that Canteen had done the service before and we had issues is bothersome. Remember this is a recommendation of the President and Administration. Concerned about someone coming in after the fact of the closed bid process.
- President Nesbary stated that we are facing a difficult budget. One thing we do to insure our costs are as low as possible is to go through these processes and we made a promise to go through all contracts to get the best price. All bidders had the exact same opportunity to bid and to bid on the same playing field. The bid was won by Canteen and according to staff, it wasn't even close. He recommended the Board consider the additional cost incurred by the college, or savings that would be lost, due to this decision. The information that came forth occurred after the bid process and had no effect on it. Something that happened 14 years ago may or may not be an issue today. Canteen offers a touch screen so students know the nutritional value of

products and the opportunity for MCC to advertise events on the machine; have a cashless system that accepts credit/debit cards; reporting can track what's staying in and coming out of the machine; has a wellness program; monthly drawings for students and large drawings to win ipads, etc. The pricing gives 14.5% commission with a \$15k annual commission, \$5,000 bonus and \$1000 scholarship. These weren't included in the process, but offered by the vendor to make their bid competitive. Canteen is located in Grand Rapids.

- The Board has the ability not to allow the bid to go to the lowest bidder. They need to look at the total bid – technology, added benefits and cost structure.

Chair Crandall called for a vote to grant the contract to Compass Group Canteen; 3 voted in favor and 3 opposed; motion failed.

Trustee Osborn made a motion to postpone this for a month to review bids; second.

- Information heard today has not been heard before. Always look at what you can find to make the best decision. Take a look at it again with all of the information available. Reassess whether to rebid the process or gather more information.
- While it makes sense given the information before us, President Nesbary would have a concern rebidding this, but is okay to postpone it until the June meeting.

3 voted in favor of postponing; 2 opposed. This item is postponed until the June Board meeting.

C. General Contractor for Planetarium Remodeling Bid Award – *Rosemary Zink*

Trustee Oakes moved approval of Tridonn Construction for remodeling of the planetarium; second. Vote unanimous; motion carried.

D. Budget – *President Nesbary*

Review complete.

E. Follow-Up Diversity and Inclusion Retreat – *Chair Crandall*

Nothing new; this was discussed Monday at the Study Session.

8. New Business

A. Resolution Authorizing Preliminary Actions

Regarding New Jobs Training Program - *Dan Rinsema-Sybenga*

Trustee Lester made a motion to approve the resolution authorizing preliminary action on the new jobs training program, updating staff titles authorized to approve; second. Vote unanimous; motion carried.

9. Board of Trustees Policy Manual Updates

10. Announcements

A. President's Report – *Dr. Nesbary*

B. President's Message, May 2012 – *Dr. Nesbary*

C. Departmental Updates – *Dr. Nesbary*

- There was a question from the Board about the van accident and MCC receiving insurance money. Beth Dick will look into the value and report back.
- A reminder was given that last month an update on the Siemens contract was requested and it was stated something would be provided at the end of the fiscal year. The report will be provided to the Board at the July meeting.

D. Board Comments

- Trustee Osborn – Foundation Update – They met May 6 and had to change the time, due to not having a quorum. The ongoing problem of when to have meetings to insure a full contingency is present was discussed, including meeting less frequently to assist with scheduling and they will continue to work on it. Three leads on new board members were received and are being pursued. They have a new Foundation Board member, Sean Mullally, and a new faculty member, Kathy Bates. They spoke about looking at some small grant proposals for faculty and staff within the college – monies for certain projects or initiatives. Also spoke about the white house and reassessing those plans and the concept. The Foundation would like everyone to form a team or at least attend lunch for the Golf outing on June 8th.
- Trustee Portenga read 2.01.04 – Quorum of Bylaws. He suggested Administration come back with additional information at the next meeting to help gain a majority vote on the recommendation for item 7. B., or an alternative if the President's recommendation is not accepted. Do we make any money on this project? If not, then it comes down to higher technology vs. older technology. On this bid process, and every future bid, it could hurt MCC in the long run if every bidder comes in after the bidding process is completed, as was done today.
- The President's evaluation was very, very positive and he was thanked for all the extra work he has been putting in.
- Remember Nancy Frye in your prayers. She is recovering and doing well.
- Trustee Lester would like an answer and better understanding of why Barnes & Noble would dictate to the college to increase prices. It was clarified that they did not dictate, but just noted that it needed to be consistent.

Trustee Portenga made a motion to adjourn. With no further business the meeting was adjourned at 1:46 p.m.

Minutes submitted by Secretary, Nancy Frye.

/csd