



# Muskegon Community College

## BOARD OF TRUSTEES BOARD MEETING MINUTES

June 18, 2014 – 12:30 p.m.

Room 1100 – Stevenson Center Lecture Hall

**Present:** Chair Crandall; Vice Chair Osborn, Trustee Frye, Trustee Mullally, Trustee Oakes, Trustee Lester and Trustee Portenga

Chair Crandall called the meeting to order at 12:30 p.m.

### 1. Agenda

Trustee Oakes made a motion to remove Item 8. O., Presidential Contract Issues, from the agenda; second.

- There was a request that this agenda item be removed to allow a discussion with the entire Board.
- It was noted the Board is not voting on the contract today, but voting on certain issues to be included or not included in the contract. The contract will be presented for voting in July.

There was a majority vote in favor of removing item 8. O. from the agenda; motion carried.

Trustee Oakes made a motion to remove Item 8. P., Faculty Master Agreement Extension Request, from the agenda; motion failed for lack of a second.

Trustee Frye moved to accept the agenda as amended; second. Vote unanimous; motion carried.

### 2. Minutes

- Open Finance Committee Minutes – May 19, 2014  
Trustee Lester moved approval; second. Vote unanimous; motion carried.
- Board Study Session Minutes – May 19, 2014  
Trustee Frye moved approval; second. Vote unanimous; motion carried.
- Board Closed Session Minutes – May 19, 2014
- Board Meeting Minutes – May 21, 2014  
Trustee Lester moved approval; second. Vote unanimous; motion carried.
- Board Closed Session Minutes – May 21, 2014

### 3. Public Comments – there were no public comments.

### 4. Consent Agenda (*Board Action Required - Vote*)

Trustee Osborn moved approval; second. Vote unanimous; motion carried.

#### A. Budget/Finance

1. Finance Committee Report – *Trustee Lester*
2. Treasurer and Financial Reports – *Trustee Lester*

B. Personnel

I. Personnel Committee Report – *Trustee Mullally*

There were no additional reports.

5. Administrative Reports

- A. Academic Affairs – *Teresa Sturris*
- B. Student Success Report – *Dr. John Selmon*
  - a. Enrollment
  - b. Student Success Completion Agenda
- C. Personnel Report – *Jerry Conrad*

There were no additional reports.

6. Business Non Operational

- A. MCCA Report – *Trustee Lester*
- B. Foundation Update – *Vice-Chair Osborn*

The Foundation met their goals and appreciates and thanked all who worked so hard on the Jayhawk Scramble. The next Foundation meeting is scheduled for August and the next event is Founder's Day in September.

7. Old Business

- A. Construction Project Committees – Updates were included in the Board packet.
  - a. Steering Committee
    - i. Science Center
    - ii. Health Center
    - iii. Arts Center
    - iv. Downtown Center

8. New Business – The Public Hearing on the Budget was opened prior to addressing Items 8. A. and 8. B.

A. Tuition and Fee Increase – *Beth Dick*

Trustee Portenga moved approval; second.

- Information was requested by the Board reflecting a scenario of APS, the president and adjunct being frozen, which was distributed by Beth Dick.
- It was stated that piggybacking on last year's budget, at some point the Board is going to have to consider freezing salaries. Whenever we're operating at a deficit, we should always assess the impact. Although the staff and president have presented a balanced budget, it is difficult to put so much on the student's backs, including course fee increases. It was noted it should start at the top and impact the unions' future as well.
- Dr. Nesbary responded that each year we discuss tuition and fees for our students versus other institutions including the impact it might have on our students' willingness to attend MCC. Reviewing the difference between MCC's tuition and our closest competitors, MCC's baseline tuition is anywhere from \$13.50 to \$345.80 less. MCC has to work within the parameters and revenues available and local revenues have been decreasing. Although state revenues have increased, they have not increased to the extent that inflation, healthcare costs, or other costs have increased. Since President Nesbary has been at MCC, tuition has consistently been at or below statewide averages. These are just some of the challenges MCC is facing, and given the

increase requested, we're not asking for something that is going to put MCC out of line with other institutions. Compared to MCC's sister institutions at the community college level, MCC would move to just about average, after having been at the bottom of that group of community colleges for so long.

- While the board appreciates the information, there is concern when looking at fall enrollment information, something is affecting enrollment and we need to take a look at that. Dr. Nesbary indicated the variations in enrollment are more closely aligned with the status of the economy, asking that the Board put MCC in a position where we are at least competitive.

With a majority vote in favor of the tuition and fee increase; motion carried.

B. Course Fee Increases – *Beth Dick*

Trustee Mullally moved approval; second. With a majority vote in favor of course fee increases; motion carried.

C. Public Hearing and Adoption of Budget – *Beth Dick*

Trustee Portenga moved going into a budget hearing; second. Vote unanimous; motion carried.

- A community member present stated: "I'd like to know why if your enrollment is declining, why is this going to the Board as an ask for a 5% increase, and you're still having to raise fees and tuition on our students? It will hit those that can least afford it. You can't keep raising tuition on our students; your enrollment will continue to decline because they can't afford to go. I'd like to ask just once, instead of raising everything, take a pay cut; think about our students. That used to be what education used to be about and anymore it's about business."
- Duane Rainbolt responded: "Custodial maintenance staff at MCC took a pay freeze for four years, not getting a penny; but you continue to give people money at the top and you're taking away from the students. Like she said, you'll have less people coming because they have less money to play with; and you're willing to give money to up here, but not down here."
- Joel Darling stated: "First off, I'm glad the community voted for the millage in order to do the science wing, it's much, much needed. The facilities are very old and cannot compete in today's society with 60 year old equipment and in today's advancing technology, so I'm thankful that the community came in to support that. I thank anyone who's at the bottom end who has taken pay freezes or minimal increases to support this community college to continue on . . . They publish statistics about the average salary in Muskegon County with a bachelor's degree as \$21.15 an hour, and yet the highest here for support staff I is \$18.07/\$37,000 and that's the highest tier; it's not even close at 17% less than the average for our county. So it's kind of strange that we're encouraging students to go to college, come here to MCC, and then at the same time, when you complete a 4-year degree and come to MCC to work, you're paid a whole lot less than the average. So what exactly is the financial incentive to actually go to college, that we as a college are saying, and what are we standing behind? I do support Dale Nesbary; I think he does a fantastic job; any efforts to keep him here to do the work he's doing is wonderful, I do applaud that effort. I'd also consider that you look at the other staff who are valuable to keep through the development of the science center and other upgrades. Motivating them to stay throughout these projects, to see the ins and outs of all these projects, would be beneficial. I hope the 2% I saw was incorrect . . . because that's sort of just a laugh in the face. I'm glad you're increasing adjunct pay. I was an adjunct here and for several reasons I'm not anymore, and part of that is because that pay just wasn't worth my time. I'd rather be a full time volunteer than put all the effort in to get that little paycheck. Also, in the science department there is a lot of equipment (models, chemicals, beakers) and all that stuff does go up in price. I do dearly hope that current lab fees are going to increase, because they are not covering the cost for what it takes to run these labs."
- Toby Moleski stated his frustration with the state of Michigan: "The tuition increase, in my view, is pretty plain to students and faculty. The state is continually slapping education in the

face, saying hey you should go to college, but for whatever reason people in Lansing refuse to actually invest in education and that's happening nationwide. The cost of running the college has not gone up nearly as much as tuition and that's because when I started in 2000, I think the state fund was 43% and now it's down to 23% and that's ridiculous. It's not because the college is more expensive to run, it's because people in Lansing refuse to support education."

Beth Dick presented the proposed budget.

Trustee Osborn made a motion to close the public hearing; second. Vote unanimous; motion carried.

Trustee Portenga moved that the 2014-15 budget be adopted; second. With a majority vote in favor of approving the 2014-15 budget; motion carried.

D. Personnel Adoption – APS Support Staff Wage Rate Table – *Jerry Conrad*

Trustee Osborn moved approval; second. With a majority vote in favor of adopting the APS Support Staff Wage Rate Table; motion carried.

E. Personnel Adoption – Administrative/Professional/Support Staff Salary Increase – *Jerry Conrad*

Trustee Mullally moved approval; second.

- The Board noted at some point all ranges need to be reviewed and suggested a review within the next year. The Board was provided an analysis of MCC ranges and comparative institutions in our Group II, which was posted to the board portal in March.

Trustee Portenga made a motion to amend Classification II to a range of \$54,000 to \$87,000, so everyone is in compliance; second. Vote unanimous; motion carried.

With a majority vote in favor of adopting the amended Administrative/Professional/Support Staff Salary Increase as noted above; motion carried.

F. Personnel Ratification of Appointments – *Jerry Conrad*

- Department Chairpersons and Coordinator Stipends – Summer Semester 2014
- Extra-Contractual Assignments-Summer Semester 2014
- Adjunct Faculty Assignments-Summer Semester 2014

Trustee Lester moved approval; second. Vote unanimous; motion carried.

G. Permission to Appoint Full Time Applied Technology Instructor Electronics – *Jerry Conrad*

Trustee Portenga moved approval; second. Vote unanimous; motion carried.

H. Permission to Appoint Full Time Biology Instructor – Life Sciences Department – *Jerry Conrad*

Trustee Oakes moved approval; second. Vote unanimous; motion carried.

I. Permission to Appoint Full Time Mathematics Instructor – *Jerry Conrad*

Trustee Portenga moved approval; second. Vote unanimous; motion carried.

J. Permission to Appoint Full Time Counseling Faculty – *Jerry Conrad*

Vice-Chair Osborn moved approval; second. Vote unanimous; motion carried.

K. Permission to Appoint Full Time Nursing Instructor – *Jerry Conrad*

Trustee Oakes moved approval; second. Vote unanimous; motion carried.

It was noted four of the five appointments were adjuncts.

L. Permission to Seek Bids on Computer Life Cycle – *Mike Alstrom*

Trustee Lester moved approval; second. Vote unanimous; motion carried.

- M. Request for Proposal (RFP) for Campus Security Services – *Dr. Selmon*  
Trustee Portenga moved approval; second. Vote unanimous; motion carried.
- N. Update to Foundation for MCC Bylaws – *Tina Dee*  
Vice-Chair Osborn moved approval; second. Vote unanimous; motion carried.
- O. Presidential Contract Issues – *Personnel Committee*  
This agenda item was removed from the agenda and will be discussed at the Board retreat on July 15<sup>th</sup>.
- P. Faculty Master Agreement Extension Request  
Trustee Portenga moved approval; second. Vote unanimous; motion carried.
9. Board of Trustees Policy Manual Updates – *Dr. Nesbary*
- A. Amendment to Board Policy 2.04.00  
Trustee Portenga made a motion to approve; second. Vote unanimous; motion carried.
10. Announcements
- **Board Retreat – Tuesday, July 15<sup>th</sup> @ 9:30 a.m. at the Shoreline Inn – Marina View Room**
- A. President’s Report – *President Nesbary*
- B. Departmental Updates – *President Nesbary*
- C. Board Comments
- Trustee Frye wished Trustee Mullally a happy birthday.
  - Trustee Portenga thanked everyone for their public comments, stating: “Today it really helped show the dilemma of an elected board. One thing not stated was the APS, the ‘higher level of our school’ probably doesn’t make what the market makes. They are extremely overworked, so should some of these people get raises? The president has had one raise in five years, so we have to take that into consideration. If we give them anything, you heard from someone in maintenance and they need it. There were 14 vacant positions that are not filled, so who does that work; typically the teaching side goes to adjuncts. We heard someone speak who had been an adjunct and, as far as he was concerned, he’d just as well volunteer his time than get paid what MCC pays; we pay way less than what market pays for adjunct professors. We sit up here as a Board having to juggle all of this and what’s the ultimate thing that we’re all supposed to be doing here? It’s not just giving education, it’s giving quality education. If we’re just going to be an extension of high school, so be it; but if we’re going to be a college, we need to compete with everyone who has cutting edge technology, etc., etc. It costs money. When I attended here, I think every teacher I had was a permanent instructor; I had fabulous instructors. I’m not saying an adjunct doesn’t give you that; but I will say that to have the full time faculty is important; but we’ve got 14 positions, maybe not all faculty, but then we’re giving that work to other people; We need to have a quality institution that requires give and take on everyone’s part; unfortunately, even including students. I’m glad everyone made their comments; it helps. I think it amplifies that this is not an easy job up here; and we do have a dilemma when we try to figure out what to do with tuition, with pay to instructors, faculty, support staff, etc., etc.”

Trustee Oakes moved to adjourn the meeting; second. With no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 1:29 p.m.

Minutes submitted by Secretary, Nancy Frye.

/csd